UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/500,867	07/21/2004	Masahide Ishikawa	040338	8698
	7590 03/15/201 TOS & HANSON, LL	EXAMINER		
1420 K Street, N.W.			NERANGIS, VICKEY MARIE	
Suite 400 WASHINGTON, DC 20005			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
			1796	
			MAIL DATE	DELIVERY MODE
			03/15/2010	PAPER

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

		Application No.	Applicant(s)		
Office Action Summary		10/500,867	ISHIKAWA ET AI	ISHIKAWA ET AL.	
		Examiner	Art Unit		
		Vickey Nerangis	1796		
Period fo	The MAILING DATE of this communication or Reply	appears on the cover she	eet with the correspondence a	ddress	
A SHO WHIC - Exter after - If NO - Failur Any r	ORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR RECHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING asions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication. It period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory per to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by state that the period for the provided by the Office later than three months after the management of the provided by the Office later than three months after the management of the provided by the Office later than three months after the management of the provided by the Office later than three months after the management. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).	DATE OF THIS COMN 1.1.136(a). In no event, however, iod will apply and will expire SIX (untite, cause the application to become	MUNICATION. may a reply be timely filed 6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this one ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133).		
Status					
2a)⊠	Responsive to communication(s) filed on 10 This action is FINAL . 2b) To Since this application is in condition for allow closed in accordance with the practice under the state of the st	his action is non-final. wance except for formal	•	e merits is	
Dispositi	on of Claims				
5) 6) 7) 8)	Claim(s) <u>9-12 and 15-24</u> is/are pending in the share claim(s) is/are with the claim(s) is/are allowed. Claim(s) <u>9-12 and 15-24</u> is/are rejected. Claim(s) is/are objected to. Claim(s) are subject to restriction and	drawn from consideration			
Applicati	on Papers				
10)	The specification is objected to by the Exame The drawing(s) filed on is/are: a) a Applicant may not request that any objection to the Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the control The oath or declaration is objected to by the	accepted or b) objecte the drawing(s) be held in a rection is required if the dra	beyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a). awing(s) is objected to. See 37 C		
Priority u	ınder 35 U.S.C. § 119				
 12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f). a) All b) Some * c) None of: 1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received. 2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. 3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)). * See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received. 					
Attachmen 1)	t(s) e of References Cited (PTO-892)	4) 🔲 Inter	view Summary (PTO-413)		
2) Notic Notic Inforr	e of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) nation Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08) r No(s)/Mail Date	Pape 5) 🔲 Noti	er No(s)/Mail Date ce of Informal Patent Application er:		

Application/Control Number: 10/500,867 Page 2

Art Unit: 1796

DETAILED ACTION

1. All outstanding rejections, except for those maintained below, are withdrawn in light of applicant's amendment filed on 11/16/2009.

- 2. The text of those sections of Title 35, U.S. Code not included in this action can be found in a prior office action.
- 3. No new grounds of rejection are set forth below. Thus, the following action is properly made final.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

4. Claims 9, 12, and 15-23 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Kobayashi '615 (US 6,238,615) in view of Kobayashi '863 (US 5,120,863).

The rejection is adequately set forth in paragraph 5 of Office action mailed on 7/23/2009 and is incorporated here by reference.

5. Claims 9, 12, and 15-23 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over WO '851 (WO 98/33851) in view of Kobayashi '863 (US 5,120,863).

The rejection is adequately set forth in paragraph 6 of Office action mailed on 7/23/2009 and is incorporated here by reference.

6. Claims 9-12 and 15-23 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over WO '851 (WO 98/33851) in view of Kobayashi '843 (US 6,245,843).

Application/Control Number: 10/500,867 Page 3

Art Unit: 1796

The rejection is adequately set forth in paragraph 7 of Office action mailed on 7/23/2009 and is incorporated here by reference.

Response to Arguments

Applicant's arguments filed 11/16/2009 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive. Specifically, applicant argues that the combination of (B) and C) like claimed provides for unexpected results.

In response, that data has been fully considered, however, it is insufficient to establish unexpected results because the data is not reasonably commensurate in scope with the scope of the claims. Case law holds that evidence is insufficient to rebut a *prima facie* case if not commensurate in scope with the claimed invention. *In re Grasselli*, 713 F.2d 731, 741, 218 USPQ 769, 777 (Fed. Cir. 1983). Specifically, aliphatic alcohols having 12 and 18 carbon atoms is not reasonably commensurate in scope with claimed C₆-C₃₂ aliphatic alcohol and 12-hydroxystearic acid is not reasonably commensurate in scope with claimed C₈-C₃₂ hydroxycarboxylic acid (B2). Similarly, the exemplified sulfates (C1) and amines (C3) are not reasonably commensurate in scope with what is claimed. Furthermore, the relative amounts of (B) and (C) are not reasonably commensurate in scope given that they are only 2.5 wt % for each and in a 1:1 ratio. Case law holds that whether the unexpected results are the result of unexpectedly improved results or a property not taught by the prior art, the "objective evidence of nonobviousness must be commensurate in scope with the claims which the evidence is offered to support." In other words, the showing of unexpected results must be reviewed to see if the

Page 4

Art Unit: 1796

results occur over the entire claimed range (i.e., scope). *In re Clemens*, 622 F.2d 1029, 1036, 206 USPQ 289, 296 (CCPA 1980), MPEP 716.02(d).

Conclusion

THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL. See MPEP § 706.07(a). Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire THREE MONTHS from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within TWO MONTHS of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not mailed until after the end of the THREE-MONTH shortened statutory period, then the shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than SIX MONTHS from the date of this final action.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Vickey Nerangis whose telephone number is (571) 272-2701. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday - Friday, 8:30 a.m. - 5:00 p.m.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, David Wu can be reached on (571) 272-1114. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Application/Control Number: 10/500,867

Art Unit: 1796

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent

Page 5

Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications

may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished

applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR

system, see http://pair-direct.uspto.gov. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR

system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

vn

/Vickey Nerangis/

Primary Examiner, Art Unit 1796